

Reviewer's report

Title: Effect of a Proprietary Magnolia and Phellodendron Extract on Stress Levels in Healthy Women: a pilot, double-blind, placebo-controlled clinical trial

Version: 1 **Date:** 11 January 2008

Reviewer: jerry cott

Reviewer's report:

Other things:

- a. Methods mentions "The product is standardized to not less than 1.5% honokiol and 0.1% berberine as quality control measures. Does this mean they are only marker compounds and not actives?"
- b. How were psychiatric disorders excluded? Were they interviewed by a qualified mental health professional?
- c. Did patients really abstain from any type of dietary supplement?
- d. Statistics under Efficacy incorrectly states a $p=0.0068$. This should be 0.06.
- e. Results section should not report findings from the previous study as if they were new.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.