

Reviewer's report

Title: Effect of a natural extract of chicken combs with a high content of hyaluronic acid (Hyal-Joint(R)) on pain relief and quality of life in subjects with knee osteoarthritis: a pilot randomized double-blind placebo-controlled trial

Version: 1 **Date:** 28 October 2007

Reviewer: Doerte Krockner

Reviewer's report:

The question of the paper "effect of a natural extract of chicken combs with a high content of hyaluronic acid (Hyal-Joint®) on pain relief and quality of life in subjects with knee osteoarthritis: a pilot randomized double-blind placebo-controlled trial" is interesting and well defined. Hyaluronic acid is normally administered intraarticularly. This work offers this medication as dietary supplementation for the first time without risk of infection. The methods are well described. The description is detailed so that a replication of investigation is possible. The population of this study is too small to evaluate the therapy regime. 10 versus 10 patients were planned to be investigated, but only 8 versus 7 patients were measured. 3 patients in the active test group discontinued the study because of personal problems. In the control group one patient also interrupted the study because of his work schedule, another one showed adverse events and dropped out of the study, too. In summary the power of this investigation is too small and there are no significant results regarding pain relief or changes in quality of life compared to the control group.

Another study with a larger investigational group and power would be necessary. The authors show in the active test group differences in pain relief and quality of life over the time but not in comparison to the control group.

In summary, this work must be declined in absence of power, so that the result cannot be generalized.

What next?: Reject as not of sufficient priority to merit publishing in this journal

Level of interest: Reject as not of sufficient priority to merit publishing in this journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.