

## **Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Effect of octanoic acid-rich formula on plasma ghrelin levels in cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease

**Version:** 1 **Date:** 10 April 2009

**Reviewer:** weizhen zhang

### **Reviewer's report:**

In the manuscript entitled " Effect of octanoic acid-rich formula on plasma ghrelin levels in cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease", Dr. Ashitani et al examined for the first time the plasma concentrations of acyl-ghrelin and total ghrelin in cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease. The acute and chronic effects of octanoic acid on the plasma level of acyl ghrelin were also investigated. This clinical study showed that formula containing octanoic acids increased body weight and plasma acyl-ghrelin levels in cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease. Overall, this is an interesting report and may contribute to our understanding on the nutritional management in patients with cachectic diseases. However, some concerns need to be addressed before its publication.

1. The study will be strengthened if control volunteers receive an energy match formula without octanoic acid. Without this control, weight gain in the experimental group may be interpreted as due to the additional energy provided in the formula instead of the increased level of plasma acyl-ghrelin.
2. The rationale for this study should be given in detail. For example, why cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease were selected as subjects. It will be interesting to know how these results compared to those in cachectic patients with malignant tumors, which are more common in the clinical setting.
3. Were the plasma octanoic acids levels also measured in the patients? What is the relationship between the plasma octanoic acid and the acyl ghrelin in these patients?

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.