

Reviewer's report

Title: Effect of an oral supplementation of a proprietary melon juice concentrate rich in superoxide dismutase on stress and tiredness in healthy people : a pilot, double-blind, placebo-controlled clinical trial

Version: 1 **Date:** 4 March 2009

Reviewer: Myung-Hee Chung

Reviewer's report:

Reviewer's report

In this study, authors observed effects of a proprietary melon juice concentrate rich in SOD on signs and symptoms of stress and tiredness in healthy people (EXTRAMEL) using the various parameters and found that this dietary supplement decreased the sign and symptoms of perceived stress and tiredness.

- Major Compulsory Revisions

Major problem in the results of his study is that placebo also showed statistically significant effects although effects of EXTRAMEL were a little bit bigger than those of placebo. The significant difference between the two groups of EXTRAMEL and placebo was observed mostly on D28. However, this study did not show any biochemical or pharmacological evidence or reason for observing the difference at D28. Since EXTRAMEL is an anti-oxidant and the principal assumption of its positive effects on the stress and tiredness was due to its anti-oxidant action, it is required to check whether EXTRAMEL administration changes anti-oxidant capacity of the subjects by assaying anti-oxidant activities in the sera of subjects of each group at D0, D7 and D28 and to correlate between its effects on stress and tiredness and anti-oxidant activity in the sera.

- Minor Essential Revisions

1. It is needed to add references to the statistical facts described in the first paragraph of Background on page 1.
2. It is recommended to cite any literatures studying similar actions of some other anti-oxidants in order to clarify that the observations in this study are general phenomena of anti-oxidants or unique to EXTRAMEL.
3. In "significantly more improved in the EXT group than in the P (line 17 on page 7), the word "significantly" is inappropriate since the statistical analysis showed insignificance of the parameters involved as designated as "t".
4. In Figures 6 -8 and the respective legends, results of statistical analysis should be described. Please add significance levels such as * or ** ,etc.

- Discretionary Revisions

None

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests