

Reviewer's report

Title: Effect of octanoic acid-rich formula on plasma ghrelin levels in cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease

Version: 1 **Date:** 8 April 2009

Reviewer: Hiroshi H Mukae

Reviewer's report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions

My comments;

This article is very interesting because this was written about the relation between octanoic acid-rich formula and plasma ghrelin in cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease.

Most of patients with chronic respiratory disease have nutrition problem and are prone to become emaciated. So I think that this article can be a fundamental study and be one of the reasons for administration of octanoic acid-rich formula for cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease.

But I have some questions about this article. Please answer to the questions.

Method;

- 1) How did you decide the definition of "Cachectic patients"? Some papers used "weight loss >10% of previous normal weight". I think you'd better describe the grounds for cachectic patients.
- 2) What kind of underlying diseases did the recruited patients have?
- 3) How did you deal with diabetes mellitus or glucose intolerance in this study?

Study Protocol;

- 1) You decided 1800 Kcal/ day for the daily intake calorie on Day 1 and Day 2. But I think that the key is how much their appetite or intake calorie is increased with the formula.
- 2) What is the number of the patients with the formula and without the formula in "the first trial"? Did you divide four in-patients into two groups (with and without the formula)? Or did you check the data for four in-patients under each condition (with or without the formula)?

Figure and Table

- 1) Figure 1 -à Figure
- 2) You'd better add the X-axis and Y-axis's title.
- 3) Did you have the significant difference between groups with and without the formula?

4) Were there any relationships between acyl-ghrelin levels (or rate) and growth rate in other parameters after administration of formula?

Others;

Orexygenic -à Orexigenic ?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests