

Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of a Low Carbohydrate and Low Fat Diet for Weight Maintenance in Overweight or Obese Adults Enrolled in a Clinical Weight Management Program

Version: 2 Date: 21 May 2007

Reviewer: Holle A Raynor

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

While the authors have taken the term efficacy out of the manuscript and have referenced other studies with high attrition rates - most studies at this point in time with that high of attrition rate provide intent-to-treat and completers analyses. Ideally both of these analyses should be provided.

More detail has been provided about the dietary intake of participants, but a complete description is necessary. So a table of the energy intake and the macronutrient content of the diet at the main assessments points, along with indication of statistical outcomes, is necessary. As this study is testing two dietary prescriptions, a complete description of the dietary data is imperative.

It is still not clear why the authors are using participant as their unit of analyses. The authors state that assignment of diet was conducted at the clinic level, and while it is understandable why participants within a clinic were not randomized to the two diets, this reasoning does not allow the unit of analyses to be the participant. The analyses should take into account the clinic level as stated in the previous review.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.