

## **Reviewer's report**

**Title:** A Newly Developed Snack Effective for Enhancing Bone Volume

**Version:** 1 **Date:** 14 April 2009

**Reviewer:** Giampiero I Baroncelli

### **Reviewer's report:**

It is an interesting study showing the possibility to influence bone density and volume by nutritional factors, as documented by many literature studies. However, the data may be useful for a future practical approach in clinical setting.

#### Specific comments

1. Have the authors a possible explanation by the fact that males and females showed similar results, independent of the isoflavone effects on bone metabolism?
2. Have the authors some information about the occurrence of side effects following snack administration?
3. The authors showed a clear improvement of some densitometric parameters following snack administration. However, a long-term follow-up should be needed in order to exclude that the results are not transient. Indeed, in humans calcium supplementation may give transient effects on bone mineral density, but some meta-analyses have reported only very small positive effects on bone mass and density.
4. Further studies to verify which component(s) of the snack is more useful in improving bone density and volume should be useful.