

## Reviewer's report

**Title:** Does the History of Food Energy Units Suggest a Solution to "Calorie Confusion"?

**Version:** 1 **Date:** 10 October 2007

**Reviewer:** Michi Yukawa

### Reviewer's report:

#### General

This was a comprehensive historical review of how different nutritional energy units came to be used. The author was able to meet the objectives of the paper as he stated in the introduction. However, at times, his explanation of how different energy units were introduced was confusing.

-----

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Consider defining all the different energy units in the beginning so that the reader will be aware of the differences in definition prior to your explanation of how each term came to be used. For example state what joule, g-calorie, kg-calorie, kcal mean and how they are different from Atwater's use of Calorie.

-----

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Please define SI system once. Although it is a commonly used term, some readers may not be aware of its definition.

-----

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

None

**What next?:** Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.