

Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of a Low Carbohydrate and Low Fat Diet for Weight Maintenance in Overweight or Obese Adults Enrolled in a Clinical Weight Management Program

Version: 2 Date: 12 June 2007

Reviewer: Jeff Volek

Reviewer's report:

There is a great deal of variability in what are described as compliant subjects. According to figures, body weight responses ranged from -23 kg to +17 kg in the low carb group. Similar responses should be reported for low fat. Certainly with this much variability statistical power is low. However, these varied responses are quite fascinating and clearly shows that some people do very well and some very poor on both diets. I really think that given the lack of other biological measures, this is the potential real value of the study and you have an opportunity to showcase the diverse responses to different diets and discuss the implications for managing body weight. As analyzed and written/discussed this is only done in a very superficial manner.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.