

Author's response to reviews

Title: Comparison of a Low Carbohydrate and Low Fat Diet for Weight Maintenance in Overweight or Obese Adults Enrolled in a Clinical Weight Management Program

Authors:

James D. LeCheminant (jlechem@siue.edu)
Cheryl A. Gibson (cgibson@kumc.edu)
Debra K. Sullivan (dsulliva@kumc.edu)
Sandra Hall (shall@kumc.edu)
Rik Washburn (rwashburn@ku.edu)
Mary C. Vernon (mvernonmd@yahoo.com)
Chelsea Curry (ccurry@ku.edu)
Elizabeth Stewart (estewart@transformed.com)
Eric C. Westman (westm001@mc.duke.edu)
Joseph E. Donnelly (jdonnelly@ku.edu)

Version: 4 **Date:** 4 October 2007

Author's response to reviews: see over

Comments to Reviewer

We appreciate the reviewer's continued responses and we understand the concern with the analysis. The reviewer's point is clear that non-randomized trials with separate groups/site/clinic should be analyzed with a more conservative cluster analysis rather than by person. We've consulted with multiple biostatisticians on this point and it has been recommended to us that 2 groups/sites are not adequate for a cluster analysis and may, in fact, bias the outcome. We recognize this as a limitation of the study, and have added commentary into our Discussion section of this as a limitation.

Please keep in mind that the data provides unique insights into weight maintenance on a low carb or low fat diet but it is not a study in which we are confirming a hypothesis...the study design does not allow for this. Rather, it is generating an interesting and relatively unstudied hypothesis to be used for more adequately powered randomized controlled trials that will better address these diets for weight maintenance or to prevent weight gain.